What is the right balance between security and personal freedom?

Supporting Questions

1. What is the purpose of government according to Thomas Hobbes and John Locke?
2. How do the Nation's founding documents address the concepts of Liberty and Security?
3. How have historical events led Americans to reassess/alter the balance between security and liberty?
What is the right balance between security and personal freedom?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inquiry Standard</th>
<th>SS8H3: Analyze the role of Georgia in the American Revolutionary Era. Interpret the three parts of the Declaration of Independence (preamble, grievances, and declaration) and identify the three Georgia signers of the document.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staging the Compelling Question</td>
<td>Use the <em>Images of Liberty</em> primary source set to stimulate student thinking about what freedom means to them. Have students create a bubble map (independently or as a class) to create a “big picture” view of what liberty means to them.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Question 1</th>
<th>What is the purpose of government according to Thomas Hobbes and John Locke?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Question 2</td>
<td>How do the Nation’s founding documents address the concepts of Liberty and Security?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Question 3</td>
<td>How have historical events led Americans to reassess/alter the balance between security and liberty?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Formative Performance Task | To complete this task have students watch the BBC video about Thomas Hobbes or read the the "Why Government" document by iCivics to introduce the two philosophers and their opinions on the purpose of government. In a *t-chart* list the viewpoints of each philosopher regarding how society agrees to to be governed or not. Use the attached images of primary sources to illustrate differing types of political power (absolute monarchy vs republic) and to help illustrate what people believe they have the right to do or own within society. Make sure to take note of the Latin phrasing around the coin and discuss the concept of Natural Rights as laid out by John Locke. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summative Performance Task</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **ARGUMENT**  
Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, poster, essay) in response to the compelling question using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical sources, while acknowledging competing views. |
| **EXTENSION**  
Create a visual representation of a scale/balance with each side representing the two parts of the compelling question. Fill each side with “must-haves” for security and liberty. Try to find the balance. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taking Informed Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **UNDERSTAND**  
Debate to what extent teenagers have privacy from their parents. What measures must parents take to keep their children safe while giving them the freedom to be themselves? Topics could include internet access, driving, phone use, etc. |
| **ASSESS**  
Determine how important the issue of privacy is to students in the class. |
| **ACTION**  
Write a letter to the editor of the local paper, member of the local school board, or the Parent-Teacher Association with recommendations for balancing freedom and security for teenagers. |
Overview

Inquiry Description

This is the lead inquiry to a series of inquiries that will center around civic education based on the theme of *The United States Constitution: Ensuring Liberty and Justice for All*. This 8th grade annotated inquiry asks students to consider what factors affect both freedoms and safety within society and how those terms are subjective regarding the differing needs of the citizenry. Students will be asked to consider the Social Contract Theory and how the Founding Fathers as well as everyday citizens attempt to find the balance between liberty and security. This inquiry guides students to think about their own freedoms and at what cost they would be willing to give up those freedoms. It presents the concept of government as a necessity for democratic society. Students will assess founding documents such as the Declaration of Independence, the U.S. Constitution, and the Bill of Rights to discover how these documents address these topics. Finally, students will assess major events within American history that have forced Americans to reconsider the balance between these two concepts.

Structure

This inquiry begins with an examination of the Social Contract Theory and the two major contributors to it, Thomas Hobbes and John Locke. From there students will assess documents related to the founding of the nation and explain how the Founding Fathers wove the themes of liberty and security into the documents. Finally, students will consider major events in American History that have caused the citizens of this nation to reassess the balance between liberty and security.
### Staging the Compelling Question

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compelling Question</th>
<th>What is the right balance between security and personal freedom?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Featured Sources</strong></td>
<td>• Source A: Images of Liberty: A Primary Source Set</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Staging the compelling question**

This brainstorming activity prompts students to consider everyday freedoms they both enjoy and rely upon. Students will have to think about what freedoms are important to them as well as those that are important to their classmates. Student responses will naturally be different from student to student. Students will have to assess the concept of liberty in regard to others'. This should lead to a discussion about students' own freedoms and how they may tread upon someone else's freedoms.
Currier & Ives: a catalogue raisonné / compiled by Gale Research. Detroit, MI: Gale Research, c1983, no. 2789
[https://www.loc.gov/item/ncr001344/](https://www.loc.gov/item/ncr001344/)
# Supporting Question 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Question</th>
<th>What is the purpose of government according to Thomas Hobbes and John Locke?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formative Performance Task</td>
<td>To complete this task have students watch the BBC video about Thomas Hobbes or read the &quot;Why Government&quot; document by iCivics to introduce the two philosophers and their opinions on the purpose of government. In a t-chart list the viewpoints of each philosopher regarding how society agrees to be governed or not. Use the attached images of primary sources to illustrate differing types of political power (absolute monarchy vs republic) and to help illustrate what people believe they have the right to do or own within society. Make sure to take note of the Latin phrasing around the coin and discuss the concept of Natural Rights as laid out by John Locke.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Featured Sources
- **Source A**: Examining the Social Contract Theory Secondary Sources
- **Source B**: Examining the Social Contract Theory Primary Sources

## Additional Materials
- [Abraham-Baldwin-Draft-Copy-with-Transcription.pdf](https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/3/5/6/f/5602/356f12ca7f94153dcc07db1b6e137b82bb7457e0.pdf)
- [GHS Archival Records Online_AUG IDM.pdf](https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/0/5/9/9/5602/0599328a43a1d46beddc2913c3451a49e00b96bf.pdf)

Ask students to consider the Social Contract Theory and how it relates to government.

### Formative Performance Task

Explain how the Social Contract Theory represents the balance between liberty and security.
Introduce the concept by providing access to one or both secondary sources (Thomas Hobbes, BBC Video or “Why Government?” by iCivics).

1. Thomas Hobbes, BBC
2. Why Government?, iCivics

Source:

Coin, Palmer family papers, MS 1281, Georgia Historical Society, Savannah, Georgia.
Land Grant, Lewis Strickland land grant, MS 771, Georgia Historical Society, Savannah, Georgia.
### Supporting Question 2

**Supporting Question**

How do the Nation's founding documents address the concepts of Liberty and Security?

**Formative Performance Task**

Explain how the US Constitution, Declaration of Independence, and/or the Bill of Rights address security as a theme. Do the same for liberty as a theme. Have students conduct a **Close Reading** of one or more of the documents and write a summary to conclude.

**Featured Sources**

- **Source A**: Transcript of Abraham Baldwin Draft Copy of the US Constitution
- **Source B**: Founding Documents Primary Sources

**Additional Materials**

- [BillofRights.pdf](https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/c/2/a/3/5602/c2a39d28e65f9604216486ae341c4c8dc39955a1.pdf)
- [declaration_of_independence.pdf](https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/0/3/f/5/5602/03f508b78f477aa41193971f415a9f89097b0811.pdf)
- [GHS Archival Records Online_AUG IDM.pdf](https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/0/5/9/9/5602/059932a43a1d46beddc2913c3451a49e00b96bf.pdf)

The question asks students to utilize their understanding of the Social Contract Theory and apply that knowledge to the founding documents. The Founding Fathers utilized theories of the Enlightenment to write the founding documents. This was no easy task, as many had differing opinions on how to balance liberty and security in the American Government. Freedom from tyranny and the right to protect oneself from an oppressive government were on the forefront of the founders minds.

**Formative Performance Task**

Choose excerpts of the sources below or choose to analyze one document. Students should complete **Close Reading** of each chosen source. Close Reading means the students will read the document at least three times to gain an understanding of it and texts should be chunked according to students' reading levels.

**Close Reading:**

1. Read the document without any analysis. Circle or underline words that you do not know. (Look up or review any terms or phrases that need to be defined for students.)
2. Read the document for understanding. Summarize what the document is telling you. Have students write any questions they have in the margins or on their own paper.
3. Read the document and highlight words or phrases that relate to liberty and security. Compile a list of those terms.
Excerpt

Preamble of the United States Constitution from Abraham Baldwin’s (GA) annotated draft of the US Constitution printed during the Constitutional Convention of 1787, GHS

Source:
United States Constitution draft annotated by Abraham Baldwin, MS 1703, Georgia Historical Society, Savannah, Georgia.
Supporting Question 2

Featured Source B  Founding Documents Primary Sources


United States Constitution draft annotated by Abraham Baldwin, MS 1703, Georgia Historical Society, Savannah, Georgia.
A Declaration by the Representatives of the United States of America, in General Congress assembled.

When in the course of human events it becomes necessary for the people to dissolve the political bands which have connected them with others and to assume among the powers of the earth the separate and equal station to which the Laws of Nature and of Nature's God entitle them, a decent respect to the opinions of mankind requires that they should declare the causes which impel them to the separation.

We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal, that they are endowed by their Creator with certain unalienable Rights, that among these are Life, Liberty and the pursuit of Happiness. That to secure these rights, Governments are instituted among men, deriving their just powers from the consent of the governed. That whenever any Form of Government becomes destructive of these ends, it is the right of the people to alter or to abolish it, and to institute new Government, laying its foundation on such principles and organizing its powers in such form, as to them shall seem most likely to effect their safety and happiness. Prudence, indeed, will dictate that Governments long established should not be changed for light and transient causes; and accordingly all experience hath shown, that to effect their ends, Governments of all kinds have been established. From the appearance of society there is something inbred in man, which inclines him to these tender and generous reflections; and which Author of Happiness, it is their right, it is their duty to live and to die,

It is our duty to provide for their future support such as has been the patient suffering of these colonies. Which is now the necessity, which compels them, to dissolve the political bands which have connected them with others; and to assume among the powers of the earth the separate and equal station to which the Laws of Nature and of Nature's God entitle them.

Supporting Question 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Question</th>
<th>How have historical events led Americans to reassess/alter the balance between security and liberty?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formative Performance Task</td>
<td>Students should choose on of the following events to investigate: 1. The Cold War 2. The Pentagon Papers 3. September 11, 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students should use the attached sources to learn more about these events. Have students analyze the sources for the affects the event had upon American society. Write a thesis statement responding to supporting question #3. Have students search for one additional primary source on the web that supports their thesis statement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Featured Sources | • **Source A**: Pentagon Papers: NSA Receives Bell’s OK on Surveillance, 1978  
• **Source B**: FBI File of Jane Dudley document & Restricting Soviet Travel in the US During the Cold War Map  
• **Source C**: Federal Intelligence Security Act, Senate Intelligence Hearings, 1978  
• **Source D**: September 12, 2001 Artwork & The Ticking Time Bomb Political Cartoon  
• **Source E**: Truman Signs the National Security Act article  
• **Source F**: The Pentagon Papers Video  
• **Source G**: House Joint Resolution, Declaring War, US Congress, 2001 |
| Additional Materials | • [hearings on FISA 1978 (1).pdf](https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/3/c/5/b/5602/3c5bac5e17fb2c2557d834443a41d89abb605b87.pdf)  
• [GHS Archival Records Online_AUG IDM.pdf](https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/0/5/9/9/5602/0599328a43a1d46bedgcd2913c3451a49e00b96bf.pdf) |

This question asks students to consider why the balance between liberty and security may change over time. It asks students to investigate major historical events that have altered American’s perception of security as a nation leading to changes in the liberties we possess.

**Formative Performance Task**

Students analyze major events in American history to understand the ever-changing nature of our freedoms in light of maintaining security. For each event there are three sources attached for student analysis.

The Cold War:

- “Truman Signs the National Security Act”, History.com  
- FBI File of Jane Dudley, dancer and suspected communist party member, 1944, LOC  
- "Restricting Soviet Travel in the U.S. During the Cold War”, Timothy Ong, LOC –Blog w/ primary source map

The Pentagon Papers:

- newspaper article, "NSA Receives Bell’s Ok for Surveillance", 1978, GHS  
- *FISA Hearings 1978*, US Senate Intelligence  
- "The Pentagon Papers", History.com

September 11, 2001

- *The Ticking Time Bomb Scenario*, Matt Bors, 2007, OSU
Supporting Question 3

Featured Source A

Pentagon Papers: NSA Receives Bell’s OK on Surveillance, 1978

Scrapbook page of newspaper clippings. Griffin Bell papers, MS 2305, Georgia Historical Society, Savannah, Georgia.
I believe this bill is remarkable not only in the way it has been developed, but also in the fact that for the first time in our society the clandestine intelligence activities of our government shall be subject to the regulation and receive the positive authority of a public law for all to inspect. President Carter stated it very well-in announcing this bill when he -said that- "one- of the-most-difficult 13 tasks in a free society like our own is the correlation between adequate intelligence to guarantee our nation’s security on the one hand, and the preservation of basic human rights on the other." It is a very delicate balance to strike, but one which is necessary in our society, 'and a balance which cannot be achieved by sacrificing either our nation’s security or our civil liberties. In my view this bill strikes the balance, sacrifices neither our security nor our civil liberties, and assures that the abuses of the past will -remain in the past and that the dedicated and patriotic men and women who serve this country in intelligence positions, often under substantial hardships and even danger, will have the attiruation of Congress that their activities are proper and necessary.  (FISA Hearings 1978, US Senate Intelligence)

PREPARED STATEMENT OF HON. GRIFFIN B. BELL, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE UNITED STATES, BEFORE THE SENATE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE, SUBCOMMITTEE ON CRIMINAL LAWS AND PROCEDURES

Source:
Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1978: Hearings before the Subcommittee on Intelligence and the Rights of Americans of the Select Committee on Intelligence of the United States Senate, Senate, 95th Congress. 1, 11-13 (1978) (Testimony of Griffin Bell).
**NEW VOCABULARY:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ground Zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Pile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>suicide hijackers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Office of Homeland Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heightened state of alert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security checkpoints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthrax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bioterrorism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cipro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stockpiling supplies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military tribunals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sky marshals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Covert operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patriotic shopping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sir Rudy Giuliani</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE TICKING TIME BOMB SCENARIO:

OK, WE'VE TIED UP A TERRORIST AND SOMEHOW FOUND OUT THAT A NUCLEAR BOMB WILL DETONATE IN FIVE MINUTES AND ONLY HE KNOWS WHERE IT'S LOCATED!

QUICK, DRIVE DOWN TO THE TORTURE SUPPLY STORE AND GRAB SOME PLIERS. AN ELECTRIC DRILL DRILL AND A DO-IT-YOURSELF WATERBOARDING KIT - WE'VE GOT TO GET SOME INFO OUT OF THIS GUY FAST!

BORS
Excerpt

Truman Signs the National Security Act, History. C..

Source:
Supporting Question 3

**Featured Source F**
The Pentagon Papers Video

**Excerpt**

*The Pentagon Papers, History.com*

**Source:**
Excerpt

**HJ Res. 62, Declaring War, US Congress, 2001**

**Source:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compelling Question</th>
<th>What is the right balance between security and personal freedom?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Argument</td>
<td>Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, poster, essay) in response to the compelling question using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical sources, while acknowledging competing views.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension</td>
<td>Create a visual representation of a scale/balance with each side representing the two parts of the compelling question. Fill each side with “must-haves” for security and liberty. Try to find the balance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Argument**

Students should use the thesis statement they created for formative task #3 to write a full length essay responding the the compelling question.

**Extension**

Students should debate differing issues to try to find the balance.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taking Informed Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Understand</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assess</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Allow students to apply the concept of balancing liberty and security in their own lives by assessing their right to privacy.
• Aug IDM Bibliography.pdf (https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/8/8/3/6/5602/88362ef10721bca8f1aba09bccc687a0f6534bef.pdf)

• GHS Archival Records Online_AUG IDM.pdf (https://s3.amazonaws.com/idm-dev/u/0/5/9/9/5602/0599328a43a1d46beddc2913c3451a49e00b96bf.pdf)